Oceanic oxygenation events in the anoxic Ediacaran ocean

S. K. SAHOO,1 N. J. PLANAVSKY,2 G. JIANG,1 B. KENDALL,3 J. D. OWENS,4 X. WANG,5 X. SHI,5 A. D. ANBAR6 AND T. W. LYONS7

1Department of Geoscience, University of Nevada, Las Vegas, NV, USA
2Department of Geology and Geophysics, Yale University, New Haven, CT, USA
3Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, ON, Canada
4Department of Earth, Ocean and Atmospheric Science, Florida State University, Tallahassee, FL, USA
5School of Earth Science and Resources, China University of Geosciences, Beijing, China
6Department of Chemistry and Biochemistry, School of Earth and Space Exploration, Arizona State University, Tempe, AZ, USA
7Department of Earth Sciences, University of California, Riverside, CA, USA

ABSTRACT

The ocean-atmosphere system is typically envisioned to have gone through a unidirectional oxygenation with significant oxygen increases in the earliest (ca. 635 Ma), middle (ca. 580 Ma), or late (ca. 560 Ma) Ediacaran Period. However, temporally discontinuous geochemical data and the patchy metazoan fossil record have been inadequate to chart the details of Ediacaran ocean oxygenation, raising fundamental debates about the timing of ocean oxygenation, its purported unidirectional rise, and its causal relationship, if any, with the evolution of early animal life. To better understand the Ediacaran ocean redox evolution, we have conducted a multi-proxy paleoredox study of a relatively continuous, deep-water section in South China that was paleogeographically connected with the open ocean. Iron speciation and pyrite morphology indicate locally euxinic (anoxic and sulfidic) environments throughout the Ediacaran in this section. In the same rocks, redox sensitive element enrichments and sulfur isotope data provide evidence for multiple oceanic oxygenation events (OOEs) in a predominantly anoxic global Ediacaran–early Cambrian ocean. This dynamic redox landscape contrasts with a recent view of a redox-static Ediacaran ocean without significant change in oxygen content. The duration of the Ediacaran OOEs may be comparable to those of the oceanic anoxic events (OAEs) in otherwise well-oxygenated Phanerozoic oceans. Anoxic events caused mass extinctions followed by fast recovery in biologically diversified Phanerozoic oceans. In contrast, oxygenation events in otherwise ecologically monotonous anoxic Ediacaran–early Cambrian oceans may have stimulated biotic innovations followed by prolonged evolutionary stasis.

Received 08 December 2015; accepted 06 February 2016

Corresponding author: G. Jiang. Tel.: +1 702 895 2708; fax: +1 702 895 4064; e-mail: Ganqing.Jiang@unlv.edu

INTRODUCTION

The Ediacaran Period (635–541 Ma) is generally thought to mark a fundamental shift in Earth’s surface redox state (Canfield et al., 2007; Och & Shields-Zhou, 2012; Lyons et al., 2014) and encompasses the emergence of complex ecosystems (Sperling et al., 2013; Xiao, 2014; Droser & Gehling, 2015). Metazoans first appeared in the earliest Ediacaran (Yin et al., 2007) or during the Cryogenian (Love et al., 2009; Erwin et al., 2011), yet evidence of animals with energy-expensive and O2-demanding lifestyles, such as motility and predation, appear much later in the fossil record (≤590–558 Ma; Narbonne, 2004, 2005; Xiao & Laflamme, 2009; Pecoits et al., 2012; Chen et al., 2014; Droser & Gehling, 2015). This pattern of an early appearance but late ecological diversification may be tied to shifts in the oxidizing capacity of Earth’s surface throughout the Ediacaran and early Cambrian (Knoll & Carroll, 1999; Knoll, 2011; Chen et al., 2015a).

Currently, there are seemingly contradictory views of the Ediacaran marine redox evolution. Several records suggest ocean oxygenation around or after 580 Ma, the
time period following the last of the major Neoproterozoic glaciations (Canfield et al., 2007; Scott et al., 2008). More recently, it has been argued that ocean oxygenation became pervasive during the earliest Ediacaran (ca. 635–630 Ma), in the immediate aftermath of the Marinoan glaciation (Sahoo et al., 2012). Both of these views seemly conflict with evidence for generally persistent, widespread anoxic conditions (Canfield et al., 2008; Li et al., 2010; Sperling et al., 2015) and with a lack of evidence of ocean ventilation in some Ediacaran basins (Johnston et al., 2013). Further, most of the Ediacaran seems to be a time period in which iron is commonly the anoxic water column or pore-water redox buffer (ferruginous conditions), instead of sulfide. Ferruginous oceans are a common feature in Earth’s early history (Poulton & Canfield, 2011), when generally reducing conditions prevailed, but is extremely rare in well-oxygenated sulfate-rich oceans.

A new, stratigraphically more continuous window into Ediacaran marine redox conditions is needed to reconcile apparently conflicting views about the Ediacaran redox evolution. In this paper, we report a multi-proxy study that constrains local and global redox conditions of the Ediacaran ocean from a deep-water section at Wuhe, South China (Fig. 1). The Wuhe section is ideally suited for tracking the Ediacaran ocean redox evolution because (1) it was paleogeographically located in the slope of the Ediacaran Yangtze platform (Fig. 1B,C; Jiang et al., 2011), a passive margin developed in the southeastern side of the Yangtze Block (YB) that was well connected with the open passive margin developed in the southeastern side of the Yangtze Gorges area (Sahoo et al., 2012). Further, most of the Ediacaran seems to be a time period in which iron is commonly the anoxic water column or pore-water redox buffer (ferruginous conditions), instead of sulfide. Ferruginous oceans are a common feature in Earth’s early history (Poulton & Canfield, 2011), when generally reducing conditions prevailed, but is extremely rare in well-oxygenated sulfate-rich oceans.

STRATIGRAPHY AND AGE CONSTRAINTS

The Wuhe section (N 26°45’93.6", E 108°25’0.5") in Guizhou Province crops out along the Qingshui River in Taijiang County. The section includes the Doushantuo (120 m), the Dengying (12 m), and the Liuchapo (40 m) formations and a few meters of the basal Niutitang Formation (Figs 1D and 2). The Doushantuo Formation can be divided into four distinct members (Members I–IV) that are roughly correlatable with those in the Yangtze Gorges area (Fig. 1D; Jiang et al., 2011). The base of the Doushantuo Formation consists of a 2.3-m-thick cap carbonate (Member I) that overlies the glacial diamictite of the Nantuo Formation and serves as a marker for regional stratigraphic correlation (Jiang et al., 2006). The top of the Doushantuo Formation is characterized by 5-m-thick, organic-rich black shales with sparse fist-sized phosphatic-pyrite nodules (Member IV). This black shale interval is also a distinctive marker across the Ediacaran Yangtze platform and is correlatable with the Member IV black shales in the Yangtze Gorges area. The majority of the Doushantuo Formation consists of laminated black shales with subordinate micritic or microcrystalline dolostone and a few layers of olistostome dolostone breccias (Members II and III). In the middle of the Doushantuo Formation, a thick (2.5–4 m) dolostone breccia layer may record a regional stratigraphic discontinuity that has been tentatively correlated across the Yangtze platform (Jiang et al., 2007, 2011). This interval also marks the Member II and III boundary (Figs 1D and 2) in this section.

The 12-m-thick Dengying Formation in this section is composed of micritic-microcrystalline dolostone with lenticular chert beds or nodules. This unit is most likely time-equivalent to the lowermost portion (Hamajing Member) of the Dengying Formation in the Yangtze Gorges area (Jiang et al., 2007, 2011; Zhu et al., 2007). The overlying Liuchapo Formation, which consists of 40-m-thick bedded cherts with thin black shale interbeds, is overlain by phosphatic organic-rich black shales of the Niutitang Formation (or Jiunenchong Formation in local stratigraphic terms). Only a few meters of the basal Niutitang Formation is continuously exposed in this section. There are sponge spicules and trilobites in the Niutitang confirming a Cambrian age.

Based on the distinctive marker beds and regional stratigraphic correlation, the base of the Doushantuo Formation is reasonably assigned an age of ca. 635 Ma (Fig. 1D; Condon et al., 2005). The top of the Doushantuo Formation was previously thought to be ca. 551 Ma. Recent studies, however, indicate that the age of 551.1 ± 0.7 Ma from the top of the Miaohe Member in the Yangtze Gorges area (Condon et al., 2008; Zhang et al., 2005) may be much younger than the Doushantuo Member IV black shales (An et al., 2015). With this new update, the age of the Doushantuo Member IV is estimated as ca. 560 Ma (Fig. 1D; An et al., 2015). Regional stratigraphic analyses correlated the Member II–Member III boundary with a regional stratigraphic discontinuity in shallow-water facies (Jiang et al., 2011). If this regional discontinuity recorded a sea-level fall event, it might be time-equivalent with the Gaskiers glaciation at ca. 580 Ma. The Liuchapo–Niutitang boundary was traditionally considered as the Ediacaran–Cambrian (E–C) boundary, but recent U–Pb ages of 522.7 ± 4.9 Ma (Wang et al., 2012a) and 522.3 ± 3.7 Ma (Chen et al., 2015b) from the basal Niutitang Formation suggested that the E–C boundary is located within the Liuchapo Formation, which is now confirmed by the age of 542.6 ± 3.7 Ma a few meters below the Liuchapo–Niutitang boundary (Chen et al., 2015b).
SAMPLES AND ANALYTICAL METHODS

Samples were collected at an average spacing of 20–50 cm (depending on the availability of black shales) along the eastern side of the Qingshui River in a dry season when part of the river channel was exposed, leaving fresh and clean outcrops. Large samples (0.5–1 kg) were collected from the field, and they were cut into slabs before powdering. Only the center part of samples without macroscopic pyrites was used for chemical analyses.

Major and trace elemental abundances, iron speciation, and total organic carbon (TOC) were mostly analyzed at the Biogeochemistry Lab at the University of California, Riverside (UCR). A portion of the samples was analyzed at the W. M. Keck Foundation Laboratory for Environmental Biogeochemistry, Arizona State University (ASU).

Sample preparation and analyses follow previously published methods (Poulton & Canfield, 2005; Scott et al., 2008; Kendall et al., 2010; Li et al., 2010).

Major and trace element concentrations

Powdered sample splits were ashed for 8–10 h at 550 °C and dissolved by HF-HNO₃-HCl acid digestion. Trace and major element concentrations were determined on a ThermoFinnigan X-Series (ASU) and Agilent 7500E (UCR) quadrupole ICP-MS (inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry). Accuracy and precision were monitored with duplicate samples and the US Geological Survey Devonian black shale standard SDO-1. Analytical reproducibility in individual runs was within 5% for the presented elements.
Iron speciation

Biogeochemically highly reactive iron (FeHR) is defined as pyrite iron (FePY) plus other iron phases that are potentially reactive with hydrogen sulfide on diagenetic timescales: carbonate-associated iron (FeCarb), ferric oxides (FeOx), and magnetite (FeMag). Hence, highly reactive iron can be expressed as FeHR = FePY + FeCarb + FeOx + FeMag (Poulton & Canfield, 2005; Canfield et al., 2007). FePY was calculated (assuming a stoichiometry of FeS2) from the weight percentage of sulfur extracted during a 2-h hot chromous chloride distillation followed by iodometric titration. Other iron species—FeCarb, FeOx, and FeMag—were extracted sequentially using sodium acetate solution, dithionite solution, and ammonium oxalate, respectively. The sequential extracts were analyzed with an Agilent 7500ce ICP-MS. Total iron concentrations (FeT) were determined by HF-HNO3-HCl acid digestion followed by ICP-MS analysis. Analytical reproducibility of iron measurements, monitored by duplicate analyses within and between sample batches, was typically within 5%, with the exception of a few unusually low-Fe (<0.1 wt%) samples.

Sulfur isotopes

Pyrite sulfur was extracted for isotope measurements using chromous chloride distillation and re-precipitation as Ag2S. Sulfur isotope measurements were made with a ThermoFinnigan Delta V continuous-flow stable-isotope-ratio mass spectrometer at UCR. Sulfur isotope data are reported as permil (‰) deviations from the isotope
composition of Vienna Cañon Diablo Troilite (VCDT). Analytical precision is better than 0.2% on the basis of single-run and long-term standard monitoring.

**Organic carbon concentration**

Total organic carbon (TOC) contents were determined by taking the difference between carbonate-carbon liberated by 4M HCl and total carbon released by combustion at 1400 °C, both of which were measured with an ELTRA C/S determinator at UCR. Analytical precision for TOC monitored by duplicates is better than 0.1%.

**Mo and U enrichment factors**

Authigenic Mo and U enrichment factors (EFs) are calculated with the equation $X_{EF} = ([X/Al]_{sample}/[X/Al]_{PAAS})$ (Tribovillard et al., 2006; Algeo & Tribovillard, 2009), where X and Al refer to their weight concentrations (ppm for Mo, U and weight percent for Al). PAAS (post-Archean average shale) data for normalization are from McLennan (2001).

**REDOX PROXIES**

We use the well-established, empirically calibrated Fe speciation proxy data to identify local water column redox conditions. These inferred local conditions then provide the background for our interpretations of regional/global marine redox based on RSE and sulfur isotope geochemistry. Black shales with $Fe_{HR}/Fe_{T} > 0.38$ are indicative of Fe scavenging under an anoxic water column (Poulton & Canfield, 2011). Similarly, $Fe_{T}/Al$ ratios greater than 0.5 in continental margin sediments is an indicator of water column anoxia (Lyons & Severmann, 2006). Anoxic shales with $Fe_{PY}/Fe_{HR} > 0.7–0.8$ are considered to represent deposition under euxinic conditions, whereas $Fe_{PY}/Fe_{HR} < 0.7$ represents ferruginous conditions (Poulton & Canfield, 2011). Independent evidence of euxinic conditions come from pyrite framboid diameters (PFD) that are consistently less than 10 μm (Wilkin et al., 1997; Wang et al., 2012b).

If black shales can be independently determined to have been deposited under locally euxinic conditions, the degree of RSE enrichments (Mo, U, Re, V, Cr) can be used to track first order shifts in the global marine redox state (Emerson & Huested, 1991; Algeo & Lyons, 2006; Lyons et al., 2009). This idea builds from two key principles: (1) the global marine redox landscape is the primary control on the size of the dissolved oceanic RSE reservoir (Emerson & Huested, 1991) and (2) the RSE reservoir exerts a first order control on RSE enrichments in euxinic sediments (Algeo & Lyons, 2006; Lyons et al., 2009). This approach is most clearly illustrated in euxinic sections that capture Phanerozoic Oceanic Anoxic Events: large drops in RSE enrichments correspond to the peak of anoxic conditions on a global scale (Hetzel et al., 2009; Owens et al., 2012). Sulfur isotopes complement the Fe and RSE proxies by providing a means to track the global redox controlled sulfur (pyrite) burial fluxes and local sulfur redox transformations (Lyons et al., 2009; Scott et al., 2014; Gomes & Hurgen, 2015).

**RESULTS**

At the Wuhe section (Fig. 2 and Table S1), the Doushanluzuo Formation shows a marked enrichment in $Fe_{HR}/Fe_{T}$ ratios (0.72 ± 0.19) and extremely low levels of ferric oxides (0.07 ± 0.18). Through most of the section, $Fe_{T}/Al$ ratios (0.52 ± 0.21) are elevated relative to typical continental margin sediments. The $Fe_{PY}/Fe_{HR}$ ratios (0.87 ± 0.13) are consistently high, and there is a strong correlation ($R^2 = 0.91$) between $Fe_{HR}$ and $Fe_{PY}$. Further, the entire succession is characterized by abundant small diameter pyrite frambooids (mean PFD = 5.4 ± 0.6 μm; n = 5274; Wang et al., 2012b).

There are three discrete intervals (ca. 635 Ma basal Member II, ca. 580 Ma basal Member III, and ca. 560 Ma Member IV) with high Mo, V, Cr, Re, and U enrichments (Fig. 2). High RSE values (1–172 ppm of Mo, 10^-10^ ppm of V, 3–16 ppm of U, 4–700 ppb of Re, and 25–201 ppm of Cr) and low $δ^{34}SPY$ values down to –34.6‰ (Fig. 2; Zone A) occur in basal Member II, followed by a progressive shift to low, crustal RSE concentrations (2–5 ppm of Mo, 80–100 ppm of V, 3–5 ppm of U, 3–46 ppb of Re, and 34–88 ppm of Cr) and a shift to high $δ^{34}SPY$ values (from –35‰ to +6‰) spanning from 10 to 60 m. At the base of Member III, we again observe high RSE values (7–15 ppm of Mo, 10^-10^ ppm of V, 16–19 ppm of U, 10–100 ppb of Re, and 230–1422 ppm of Cr) and low $δ^{34}SPY$ values down to –21.5‰ (Fig. 2; Zone B). Shortly after this metal enrichment zone, RSE values again decrease up section to near crustal levels, and $δ^{34}SPY$ increases up to +6‰ in middle-upper Member III. Lastly, in Member IV there is a third positive shift (Fig. 2; Zone C) of RSE enrichments (2–126 ppm of Mo, 10^-10^ ppm of V, 3–32 ppm of U, 10–100 ppb of Re, and 28–508 ppm of Cr) and a decrease of $δ^{34}SPY$ down to –23.3‰.

The overlying Liuchapo Formation witnesses another drop in RSE values and increase in $δ^{34}SPY$. A few high Cr and Re values and low $δ^{34}SPY$ values are also observed in the middle and upper Liuchapo Formation, but a clear temporal pattern is not observed. However, the Fe speciation data in this interval should be viewed with caution because most of the samples are siliceous shales with $Fe_{T} < 1%$. Metal enrichments are likely influenced by the general lack of sulfidic shales in this interval (for Mo in
particular, \( \text{Fe}_{\text{Py}}/\text{Fe}_{\text{HR}} < 0.7 \); Fig. 2) and/or insufficient sample resolution, given that the Liuchapo Formation is strongly condensed at this locality (~40 Ma for a 40-m-thick interval). High RSE values and low \( \delta^{34}\text{S}_{\text{PY}} \) values are observed at the basal Niutitang Formation (Zone D; Fig. 2), which are better expressed in a paleogeographically adjacent section at Hejiapu where more sulfidic black shales are present (Wang et al., 2015).

**DISCUSSION**

**Paleogeographic context for ocean redox interpretation**

In the modern oxygenated ocean, only euxinic shales in marine basins with access to the open ocean effectively capture the high dissolved RSE concentrations in seawater (Algeo & Lyons, 2006; Lyons & Severmann, 2006; Lyons et al., 2009). In ancient marine sedimentary successions, high RSE enrichments comparable to those of the modern euxinic shales (such as Zone A, B, C, and D in Fig. 2) provide strong evidence for high dissolved RSE concentrations in a broadly oxygenated ocean (Scott et al., 2008; Kendall et al., 2010; Och & Shields-Zhou, 2012; Sahoo et al., 2012; Reinhard et al., 2013; Large et al., 2014). However, low RSE values from a particular stratigraphic unit would have much less definitive meaning and could be resulted from (1) low RSE enrichments in oxic/suboxic local environments (comparable to modern oxic/suboxic sediments), (2) strong basin restriction (isolation), or (3) low dissolved RSE concentrations in poorly oxygenated ocean. We eliminate option 1 as a likely possibility because iron speciation and pyrite morphology data from the Wuhe section (Fig. 2) document persistently euxinic local environments through most of the Ediacaran. Persistent euxinia makes sense given that the Wuhe section was located paleogeographically on the middle-lower slope of the Ediacaran Yangtze platform (Jiang et al., 2007, 2011) where upwelling and high primary productivity may have fostered oxygen deficiency and sulfate reduction. The euxinic Wuhe black shales with high \( \text{Fe}_{\text{Py}}/\text{Fe}_{\text{HR}} \) values (>0.7–0.8) and small (3–6 μm) PDFs demonstrate that the majority of low RSE values from the section (Fig. 2) are not a consequence of ineffective trapping of RSEs in oxic/suboxic water column. However, the redox state of the Liuchapo Formation and some data points in Zones A and B (Fig. 2) have low (<0.7) \( \text{Fe}_{\text{Py}}/\text{Fe}_{\text{HR}} \) values, suggesting non-euxinic conditions.

It is more difficult during the Proterozoic, relative to younger intervals, to gauge the extent of basin restriction and to determine if the extent of basin isolation might have dramatically lowered water column RSE concentrations. Due to basin restriction, deep-water Mo concentrations in the modern Black Sea are as low as 4 nmol/kg, compared to ~103 nmol/kg in the open ocean (Algeo & Lyons, 2006). Previous paleoredox studies of the Doushantuo Formation in the Yangtze Gorges area (Jiulongwan section; loc. 2 in Fig. 1B–D), which was located in a paleogeographically restricted shelf lagoon setting (Jiang et al., 2011), documented unusually low RSE values (Bristow et al., 2009; Li et al., 2010). The exceptional values from this location were high RSE concentrations from the top of the Doushantuo Formation (Member IV; Scott et al., 2008; Kendall et al., 2015). On this basis, Och et al. (2015) interpreted the low RSE values from the Ediacaran succession in South China as reflecting basin restriction in the Nanhua basin, while high RSE values at the base and top of the Doushantuo Formation (Scott et al., 2008; Sahoo et al., 2012) and Ediacaran–Cambrian transition (e.g., Guo et al., 2007) record open-ocean signatures associated with major transgressive events. This interpretation implies that the open ocean was irreversibly oxygenated and had high RSE concentrations since the beginning of the Ediacaran period, which contradicts with the lack of any other evidence for broad and persistent ocean ventilation and evidence, to the contrary, for widespread anoxia in other sedimentary basins (e.g., Johnston et al., 2013; Sperling et al., 2015).

Most of the data in Och et al. (2015) are from the Yangtze Gorges area where basin restriction in an intrashelf lagoon is likely, or from short segments of the slope-basin sections where sparse data points are insufficient to show clear temporal RSE trends. In contrast, the Wuhe section data reported here provide the most temporally continuous Ediacaran redox record to date from a deep-water section likely connected with the open ocean. Paleomagnetic data and global reconstruction indicated that during the Ediacaran and early Cambrian, South China did not attach to any other major continent and was an independent continental block surrounded by oceans (Fig. 1A; Jiang et al., 2003; Zhang et al., 2013, 2015). Carbon (Jiang et al., 2007; Zhou & Xiao, 2007; Zhu et al., 2007, 2013; Tahata et al., 2012) and strontium (Sawaki et al., 2010; Cui et al., 2015) isotope profiles and the marine fossil record (Zhou et al., 2007; Liu et al., 2013) from the Doushantuo Formation are also comparable with those of the global successions, suggesting marine environments in general. The coherent, gradual temporal \( \delta^{34}\text{S}_{\text{PY}} \) trends from the Wuhe section (Fig. 2) also support an open-marine signal, in contrast with scattered \( \delta^{34}\text{S}_{\text{PY}} \) values from restricted, shelf-lagoon sections in the Yangtze Gorges area (e.g., loc. 2 in Fig. 1B–D; Mcfadden et al., 2008). Despite disagreements about the Neoproterozoic paleogeography, there is compelling evidence that the marine basin along the southeast side of the Yangtze Block was connected to the open ocean. Local restriction in the proximal intrashelf basin was likely (Jiang et al., 2011), but the slope-basin environments, where the Wuhe section was located, should have been well-connected with the global ocean.
The ratio of Mo and U enrichment factors (EFs) may also fingerprint the open ocean connection of the Wuhe section. Because Mo sinks more efficiently than U in sulfidic environments, restricted basins without open-ocean connection would have very low Mo/U ratios in the water column and in sediments (Algeo & Tribovillard, 2009). For example, in the modern Black Sea, the deep watermass has aqueous Mo/U ratios only ~4% of the open ocean seawater (Mo/U ≈ 7.5–7.9) and sediments are significantly depleted in Mo (relative to U). The Mo/U ratios of Zones A, B, and C exceed or are close to those of the modern seawater, except for a few outliers from non-sulfidic samples of Zones A and B (Fig. 3). More importantly, the Mo/U ratios of samples between Zones A, B, and C show a consistent covariation pattern that is comparable with but lower than the molar Mo/U ratio of modern seawater (1 × SW). This trend is typically interpreted as providing a signal for the occurrence of locally euxinic bottom water and unrestricted exchange between local depositional environments and the open ocean (Algeo & Tribovillard, 2009). However, caution should be used when applying this proxy to Pre-cambrian setting, given that U and Mo have different behaviors in ferruginous settings.

Ediacaran oceanic oxygenation events (OOEs)

Based on the Fe proxies and PFDs, the Wuhe section was deposited under near-persistent euxinic conditions throughout the Ediacaran. Further, the abundance of small diameter frambooidal pyrites and a lack of Fe oxides indicate limited, if any, late stage sulfide mineralization or oxic alteration. This environmental context, coupled with the lack of obvious evidence for shifts in the degree of basin isolation, sets the stage for using the degree of RSE enrichments to track the evolution of Ediacaran global marine redox landscape.

The periods with substantial RSE enrichments indicate the presence of large marine RSE reservoirs and thus a widely oxygenated ocean. Again, this idea builds from the notion that RSE reservoirs are controlled by the extent of anoxia/euxinia on a global scale and that RSE enrichments in anoxic shales track the size of the oceanic RSE reservoir (Emerson & Huested, 1991; Algeo & Lyons, 2006; Hetzel et al., 2009; Lyons et al., 2009; Sahoo et al., 2012; Reinhard et al., 2013). The RSE enrichments at ca. 635, ca. 580, and ca. 560 Ma are comparable to the levels found in Phanerozoic euxinic shales (Scott et al., 2008; Och & Shields-Zhou, 2012; Sahoo et al., 2012), which intuitively suggest comparable marine redox conditions—that is, widespread oxic conditions. In contrast to these relatively thin enriched zones, crustal (majority of Member II) or near-crustal (majority of Member III) RSE values through most of the persistently anoxic Wuhe black shale section indicate that the Ediacaran was characterized, perhaps dominantly so, by intervals of expansive and persistent euxinia and potentially ferruginous conditions. Critically, the persistence of local anoxic conditions at Wuhe allows us, from metal enrichment patterns at a single location, to make inferences about the metal reserves and thus the predominant redox conditions in the global ocean.

Recent modeling efforts suggest that at least 1–10% seafloor euxinia and ≥30% seafloor anoxia are needed to crash the Mo and Cr seawater reservoirs, respectively, to levels that favor near-crustal concentrations in euxinic shales (Reinhard et al., 2013). Thus, the coupled Fe proxy and RSE trends presented here document, for the first time, multiple oxygenation events in an overall anoxic Ediacaran ocean from a single stratigraphic succession, providing unequivocal evidence for large-scale shifts in marine redox conditions.

The large δ34S_Py variations at the Wuhe section, despite evidence for persistent water column pyrite formation from the Fe proxies and PFD record, also suggest dynamic Ediacaran redox conditions. Heavy δ34S_Py values may be linked to decreases in the marine sulfate reservoir, which could be driven by widespread expansion of euxinic conditions and increased global pyrite burial (Scott et al., 2014). Despite the preference for the light sulfur isotope (32S) during microbial sulfate reduction, sulfate–pyrite sulfur isotope fractionations become muted under limited sulfate supplies—thus resulting in isotopically heavy (34S-enriched) pyrite. In addition to these reservoir effects, it is possible that the size of the seawater sulfate reservoir decreased to the extent that combined instantaneous (Scott et al., 2014) and reservoir size effects (cf. Gomes & Hurgen, 2015) during microbial sulfate reduction generated isotopically heavy pyrites. Alternatively, shifts in δ34S_Py could be tied to variations in the areal extent and depth of oxic

![Fig. 3 Mo EF vs. U EF for the Wuhe section black shales. The dashed lines are equivalent to the molar Mo/U ratio for modern seawater (1 × SW), higher than seawater (3 × SW) and for a fraction of modern seawater (0.3 × SW), following Algeo & Tribovillard (2009).](image-url)
conditions in the surface water column offshore of the Yangtze platform. A decrease in the extent of oxic water column respiration would result in an increase in microbial sulfate reduction rates by favoring delivery of more labile organic matter to anoxic waters. This shift in rates would ultimately decrease the sulfur isotope fractionation (Δ³⁴S) and increase δ³⁴S_py values (Leavitt et al., 2013). All these factors, individually or working together, require temporally dynamic redox conditions to explain the striking observed trend in δ³⁴S of pyrites—that is, heavy δ³⁴S values coincident with low metal enrichments and vice versa.

The secular RSE pattern and Ediacaran–early Cambrian ocean redox evolution

To further demonstrate the global ocean redox history, we compiled the RSE data from the Wuhe section and other Ediacaran–early Cambrian (ca. 635–520 Ma) anoxic/euoxic shales (Fig. 4 and Table S2) in South China (Goldberg et al., 2007; Guo et al., 2007; Scott et al., 2008; Chang et al., 2010, 2012; Li et al., 2010; Sahoo et al., 2012; Pi et al., 2013; Feng et al., 2014; Chen et al., 2015a; Wang et al., 2015; Wen et al., 2015) and other sedimentary basins (Ugidos et al., 1997; Yu et al., 2009; Johnston et al., 2013; Chen et al., 2015a; Kurzweil et al., 2015). We used the ages of ca. 635 and 632 Ma (the basal Doushantuo Formation; Condon et al., 2005), ca. 580 Ma (Doushantuo Member II–III boundary), ca. 560 Ma (Doushantuo Member IV), ca. 551 Ma (the Miaobe Member; Condon et al., 2005), ca. 542 and 536 Ma (Liuchapo Formation; Chen et al., 2009, 2015b), ca. 532 Ma (Jiang et al., 2009), and ca. 522 Ma (basal Niutitang Formation; Wang et al., 2012a; Chen et al., 2015b) as anchors to constrain the age of individual data points from the South China sections. For the other Ediacaran–early Cambrian successions, we used the age model reported by individual authors.

The compiled RSE data (Fig. 4) reveal modern-level RSE enrichments at ca. 635, ca. 580, ca. 560, ca. 540, ca. 530, and ca. 522 Ma; each of these enrichments is followed by crustal or near-crustal RSE values. A precise estimation of the duration of each oxygenation event requires better geochronological framework, but the relatively thin stratigraphic thicknesses of these events roughly constrains their duration at <5–10 Ma. This secular RSE pattern highlights the presence of rises and falls in the surface oxidation state leading up to the Cambrian explosion. Importantly, this pattern is in direct contrast with a recent view that the Ediacaran–Cambrian ocean was not characterized by statistically significant changes in oxygen content (Sperling et al., 2015). The conclusion of a redox-static and dominantly anoxic Ediacaran–Cambrian ocean (Sperling et al., 2015) is drawn from iron speciation data, which are essentially a local redox proxy (e.g., Lyons et al., 2009) with low statistical probability of robustly capturing the global, mostly unsampled, redox landscape. Our approach, in contrast, relies on local measurements that are impacted by the global inventories of redox sensitive elements, which, in turn, are controlled by the global redox state of the ocean. The RSE method works much in the same way that local carbon isotope measurements in carbonate rocks can capture the global extent of organic carbon burial.

The secular RSE pattern may help explain the delay between the initial appearance of metazoans and the much later appearance and diversification of most metazoan groups until the Cambrian (Fig. 4). Of particular relevance, after the ocean oxygenation event at ca. 635 Ma, extremely low diversification rates (Erwin et al., 2011; Xiao, 2014) and a drop in acritarch diversity (Cohen et al., 2009; Mcfadden et al., 2009) seen in the fossil record between 630 and 580 Ma (Fig. 4) are potentially tied to significant global expansion of reducing conditions unfavorable for animals and complex ecosystems. Definitive mobile bilaterians did not appear until ca. 575 Ma or later (Narbonne, 2004, 2005; Xiao & Laffamme, 2009; Chen et al., 2014; Droser & Gehling, 2015), after our second and third oxygenation events at ca. 580 and ca. 560 Ma, respectively. The frequency of oxygenation events expressed in our data increases during the late Ediacaran–early Cambrian, coincident with the evolution of biomineralizing animals and predatory animals. In this light, we speculate that the ocean oxygenation events in an otherwise anoxic and ecologically monotonous Ediacaran ocean may have stimulated biotic innovations followed by prolonged evolutionary stasis after each event.

CONCLUSION

Integrated data for Fe speciation analysis, S isotope patterns in pyrite, and redox-sensitive elements from euoxic shales of a deep-water slope section in the Yangtze platform, South China, document multiple oxygenation events in an overall anoxic Ediacaran ocean. These oxygenation events may have triggered biotic innovations, separated by prolonged intervals of evolutionary stasis. The rises and falls in the surface oxidation state contrast with the recent view of a redox-static Ediacaran–Cambrian ocean dominated by anoxia and without significant changes in oxygen content. Furthermore, the highly dynamic Ediacaran redox history presented here provides a potential explanation for seemingly conflicting estimates for the timing of Ediacaran ocean oxygenation now present in the literature. This conceptual model also helps to explain the delay between the initial appearance of metazoans and the much later appearance and diversification of most metazoan groups in the early Cambrian.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research was funded by the National Science Foundation Division of Earth Science, the National Natural Science Foundation of China, the NASA Exobiology Program, and the NASA Astrobiology Institute. We thank D. Tang and Y. Wang for field assistance, C. T. Reinhard, C. Scott, L. M. Och, and S. Xiao for helpful discussions, and S. Bates and G. W. Gordon for assistance with laboratory analyses.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

The research was designed by G. Jiang, T. W. Lyons, A. D. Anbar, and X. Shi. Samples were collected by S. K. Sahoo, X. Wang, and G. Jiang. Manuscript was prepared by G. Jiang, N. J. Planavsky, S. K. Sahoo, and T. W. Lyons, with important contributions from all co-authors. Analyses were carried out by S. K. Sahoo with contributions from N. J. Planavsky, B. Kendall, and J. D. Owens.

© 2016 John Wiley & Sons Ltd

Fig. 4 Compilation of RSE data from the Wuhe section and other Ediacaran-early Cambrian euxinic shales (data are included in Table S2). For Mo, only data from euxinic shales are plotted. For V, U, Re, and Cr, anoxic (ferruginous) and euxinic shales are plotted. The data show multiple oxygenation events in an overall anoxic Ediacaran-early Cambrian ocean. This secular RSE pattern does not support the recent view of a redox-static Ediacaran-Cambrian ocean without statistically significant change in oxygen content (Sperling et al., 2015). Prolonged anoxia between ca. 630 and ca. 580 Ma corresponds with a low diversity of acanthomorphic acritarchs (Cohen et al., 2009; Mcfadden et al., 2009) and delayed diversification of major Ediacaran animal groups (Narbonne, 2004, 2005; Pecoits et al., 2012; Xiao, 2014).
REFERENCES


© 2016 John Wiley & Sons Ltd


**SUPPORTING INFORMATION**

Additional Supporting Information may be found in the online version of this article:

**Table S1.** Iron speciation, sulfur isotope, and trace element data from the Wuhe section (used for Fig. 2).

**Table S2.** Compiled geochemical data from Ediacaran–early Cambrian black shales (ca. 635–520 Ma) used for Fig. 4.